Creating an Inclusive and Accessible Varanasi City
Codesign Workshop with Persons with Disabilities
# CONTENTS

1. Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1
2. Collaborative Research Study ......................................................................................... 3
3. Overview of the Workshop ............................................................................................... 5
4. Key Objectives of the Workshop ...................................................................................... 9
5. Structure of the Workshop ............................................................................................... 11
6. Key Findings ...................................................................................................................... 15
   6.1 Session I: Storytelling ................................................................................................. 15
   6.2 Session II: Journey mapping ...................................................................................... 16
   6.3 Session III: Participatory Mapping ............................................................................ 19
7. General recommendations and Priority Areas for Intervention ......................... 23
8. Learnings and Conclusions ............................................................................................. 27
9. Annexure .......................................................................................................................... 29
Introduction

National Institute of Urban Affairs is implementing the Building Accessible, Inclusive and Safe Indian Cities (BASIIC) Programme in collaboration with Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA) and support from Foreign Commonwealth and Development Office (FCDO) of the UK Government in an effort to mainstream the need of Disability-Inclusion across urban planning and policy approach within the Indian Cities. The programme intends to work with diverse stakeholders and partners. Currently, it is supporting two partner cities (Varanasi and Pune) through a Technical Support and Assistance Unit (TASU) established at NIUA.

Global Disability Innovation Hub (GDI Hub) is a research and practice centre driving disability innovation for a fairer world. Currently, its operational in 35 countries, delivering 35 projects with solutions focussed across subjects related to Inclusive Design, Culture and participation, Assistive Technology etc. AT2030 is one of the ongoing programmes led by GDI Hub and funded by UK aid. It intends to improve access to life changing Assistive Technology (AT) for all by investing £20m over a duration of 5 years to create a positive impact on the lives of 9 million people.

GDI Hub and NIUA have entered into a partnership under the BASIIC Programme (NIUA-led) and AT2030 programme (GDI Hub-led). Under the partnership, the institutions are collaborating on research initiatives. GDI Hub is conducting a series of global case studies on inclusive and accessible cities/ infrastructure, funded by the Foreign Commonwealth and Development office (FCDO) of the UK Government, where Varanasi is one of the selected case study cities. The study will also build understanding on the current awareness and application of disability inclusive design approaches. One of the ongoing initiatives under this partnership is to conduct an audit and assessment study on understanding the current approach and city level efforts towards disability inclusion in Varanasi City. The findings from the study would highlight key insights and recommendations to transform Varanasi City as accessible, safe, and inclusive for all.
Collaborative Research Study

The ongoing city audit and assessment study/research case study in Varanasi City intends to identify the gaps and barriers in the planning, design and the implementation process of Disability Inclusive Accessible Urban Development and the experience of persons with disabilities living in the city. The study would also assist in assessing the city level efforts being undertaken across urban sectors, understanding of legislative/policy and governance setup in reference to adoption of integrated approach for inclusive development especially focusing on the needs of Persons with Disabilities irrespective of age, ability and gender.

The study involves a series of consultative process (consultations with city stakeholders, interviews with Persons with Disabilities, participatory mapping exercises and stakeholder’s consultation) along with the collection of qualitative and quantitative data. The findings and recommendations drawn from the study would assist in mainstreaming the policy and project level initiatives of the partner city (Varanasi in this case) through introducing evidence based planning and decision making process for transforming the city as accessible, safe and inclusive for all.

Participants and facilitators interacting during the workshop
Overview of the Workshop

On 12th Mar. 2021, a Co-design Workshop with Persons with Disabilities was conducted in Varanasi. The workshop was jointly organised and facilitated by GDI Hub and NIUA along with the support from Kiran Society (Varanasi based Disabled People’s Organization) and Varanasi Smart City Ltd (city stakeholder). The workshop was titled as “Co-design workshop with persons with disabilities – Creating a more inclusive and accessible Varanasi”.

The workshop was conducted as part of the collaborative research case study of GDI Hub and NIUA. It aimed to shed light on the state of inclusive design and accessible urban environment in the city of Varanasi in India. It also assisted the team in understanding the barriers and challenges faced by Persons with Disabilities in accessing basic infrastructure/services while identifying the key priority areas of improvement and recommendation for city stakeholders.

17 participants (based in Varanasi city) with varied abilities, age and gender had participated in the workshop. The disabilities varied from mobility, vision, hearing, speech, multiple sclerosis, and cerebral palsy. The gender ratio of the participants was adequate with 7 female and 10 male participants.
Participants registration in process
To ensure the workshop was accessible for all participants, the workshop had a sign language interpreter and information leaflets printed in braille. The workshop was conducted with a strict adherence to data privacy and protection protocols as followed by the GDI Hub, NIUA and Kiran Society Team.

The findings from the participatory sessions and the key learnings from the workshop support the ongoing research activities of the following two UK Aid funded programmes:

- GDI Hub-led AT2030 ‘Life changing assistive technology for all’ (sub-programme delivering inclusive design and infrastructure in 6 cities around the world).
- NIUA-led BASIIC programme on building accessible, safe and inclusive Indian cities (Varanasi being one of the partner cities).
Key Objectives of the Workshop

The workshop aimed to capture the experiences and everyday life of persons with disabilities living in Varanasi by engaging them in participatory design activities. Additionally, the workshop also intended to map innovative ideas in improving the city from the perspective of accessibility, inclusivity and safety aspects.

The following are the key objectives of the co-design workshop:

• To capture the experiences of Persons with Disabilities living with disability in the urban environment.
• Understand the barriers and challenges faced by Persons with disabilities to lead everyday life through involving them in the journey and participatory mapping exercises.

The recommendations from the participants reflected the need for adopting an inclusive planning and design approach for urban development by the city stakeholders. This approach must be participatory and engage persons with disabilities at all stages of development. The findings and suggestions highlighted the need to enforce the adoption of an inclusive design approach and accessibility standards within city planning and policy level interventions. This would also play an important role in advocating for persons with disabilities amongst stakeholders in order to mainstream a disability inclusive approach to transform Varanasi to a more accessible, safe and inclusive city.

Facilitators assisting the participants for group exercise
Structure of the Workshop

The workshop was designed to make the sessions interactive for the participants with hands-on activities in mapping the city and their experiences. The activities were divided into three sessions, each with defined objectives. The participants worked in 4 groups of 4 - 5 people with a facilitator to explain the objectives of the sessions.

Following are the key objectives of each session:

• Session I: To understand the individual experiences of living with a disability in Varanasi. Every participant introduced themselves giving a brief on their experiences of living with disability in Varanasi.

• Session II: Capture the barriers and challenges associated with everyday routines/ journeys of the participants made to school/college/work place or running their daily errands (e.g., going to markets, parks, visiting friends, moving within the neighbourhood/locality etc.). This involved mapping of the major routes/road network followed by the participants to reach their everyday destination and describing the barriers/obstacles identified between the end to end journeys covered.

• Session III: Participatory mapping approach with participants in creating a collective picture of accessibility and inclusion related challenges faced in the city. The exercise also aimed at using a city map to demarcate the most and least accessible places within the city and identifying key areas for improvement.

The session aimed to capture best practices that have been initiated by city stakeholders to make the heritage sites, public/government buildings accessible for all and suggestions/recommendations for the stakeholders to prioritise the development of certain key areas of the city of utmost importance (heritage, touristic, cultural values) to make them accessible for all.
Participants describing the everyday journeys
Participants involved in the mapping exercise and demonstrating the key findings from each group.
Key Findings

The key findings from the workshop helped develop initial insights of the physical, social, economic and cultural barriers faced by persons with disabilities within the city. Specific insights from each session are detailed in the following sections.

6.1 Session I: Storytelling

The first session consisted of an informal discussion with participants where people could get to know each other. Introductions helped the group understand the profile of the participants, type of disabilities they suffer from along and where they live. This session was intended to set the tone of the interactive and participatory sessions of the workshop and make sure everyone felt comfortable and included. Some of the findings from this session are:

- The participants represented different parts of the city, so were able to share a comprehensive view of inaccessibility and challenges persons with disabilities face in the city.
- Few of the localities to be named were Lanka, Pandeyapur, Ganga Bagh, Madhopur, Lahangpura, Azad Nagar, Jaitpura, Sigra, Shivpura, Madhopur, Banaras Hindu University, Chaitpura, Ramkatara, Suryadey, Pandeypur, Assi Ghat, and Daphi.
- The participants were accustomed to using Assistive Technologies such as electronic wheelchair, detachable wheelchair, crutches, hand support, and white canes.
- Out of the seventeen participants, four were the students of Banaras Hindu University (BHU), two were enrolled at city based educational institutions. The remaining participants were employed by Kiran Society or city based govt offices while some of them were currently unemployed.
- They reflected upon the lack of barrier free infrastructure (e.g., ramps and lifts) within the premises of the work places/institutions as well as during the journey to these places which often force them to be confined at home.
- Most of the participants mentioned about the similar spatial, economic, cultural and attitudinal barriers they frequently face while accessing basic infrastructure and services in the city environment.
  - Lack of barrier free infrastructure within the home/workplace/institution/ neighbourhood.
- Lack of access to government services and information.
- Lack of awareness and sensitization about the barriers and challenges related to disability.
- Existence of social stigma associated with disability in the society.

6.2 Session II: Journey mapping
During the session, the participants illustrated their everyday journeys to places they visit frequently i.e., school/workplace/markets/parks or their neighbourhood/locality and the key barriers/obstacles they faced during the journey.

The key findings from this session indicated similarities in challenges/barriers in everyday life and in accessing basic infrastructure in the city. The participants were vocal on the social stigma and lack of sensitivity or awareness amongst the citizens which acts as hindrance for them to move independently or to access basic services and infrastructure. The below illustrated map from the session highlights the journey of one of the participants and mapping the key route undertaken to reach every day’s destinations.

The key barriers and challenges highlighted by the participants from the session are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Access to public transport</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lack of accessible public transport is a major concern for Persons with Disabilities. Usually, they are dependent upon the support of family members for stepping out of the house or they tend to hire auto-rickshaw (three-wheeler vehicle, commonly referred as Tuk-Tuk) to commute every day. Moreover, the organic structure of the city, open drains along the road, dumping of municipal solid waste along the roadside, etc. significantly reduce the road width. Additionally, lack of streetlights, pedestrian infrastructure, and barrier free design elements, narrow lanes connecting their localities to the major city roads/street network make the city inaccessible for Persons with Disabilities.

The participants also highlighted about the movement of cattle alongside the roads/streets. This act as an additional hindrance and a matter of safety to step out of the house or locality. The aggressive nature of the cows/dogs also create obstacles for the Assistive Technologies users (e.g., wheelchair, crutches and cane) to commute independently. |
The participant described his daily life’s journey and highlighted the key obstacles faced to reach his everyday destinations e.g., workplace, recreational places (malls, park, ghat areas), public utilities, etc. The journey from house to the main street is inconvenient because of the narrow lanes, open drains, movement of cattle, etc. Lack of availability of accessible public transport facilities acts as major obstacle for everyday commute. Traffic congestion and busy street junctions create hurdle to cross the road. The participant stressed upon the need of creating provisions for accessible bus stops/auto stands, accessible foot overbridges and use of Assistive Technologies across the busy junctions to assist persons with disabilities to cross the roads. Provision for Vertical parking can also be considered by the city stakeholders. Overbridges can be made accessible by connecting it with ramps or installing lifts at busy junctions.

The participant also highlighted the inconvenience in using the public utilities. Most of the ATMs are at high plinth level and lacks appropriate ramps to access the machine. They can be made accessible by creating provision for voice over facilities, and braille friendly machines. Public toilets are installed in few of the public spaces; however, they do not meet the accessibility related compliances. Most of the malls and shopping centres do not consider the need of special assistance required by persons with disabilities. However, few of the interventions by the mall authorities do consider the special needs and have created provisions for barrier free infrastructure within their premises/buildings. For recreation purpose, the participant usually uses the parks within their neighbourhood/locality. The journey or route to reach the Ghat areas or the heritage sites located within the city is not accessible for majority of the participants.
| Access to basic utilities and services | The participants highlighted the efforts of city stakeholders in installing accessible toilet, drinking water facilities, city information centres, etc. within prominent locations of the city. Although, these utilities/infrastructure have been built across the city but they lack compliance with barrier-free design standards and hence, becomes redundant in terms of functioning or accessibility. Steep slopes, which are not compliant with the minimum design standards and improper tactile paving are barriers to accessing these utilities. |
| Access to Public and Private Buildings | Majority of the government/public buildings in the city lack accessible elements or barrier free infrastructure. The common issues identified are high plinth level, inappropriately designed ramps, lifts, toilets, and inaccessible information centres. Most of the police stations, post office, banks, and ATM facilities, etc. also do not consider the needs of persons with disabilities and hence fail to meet the minimum accessibility standards. Participants recognized that a few shopping malls and cinema halls did try to improve their accessibility but often such efforts turn out to be ineffective from the perspective of the end user. The participants also highlighted the everyday challenges they face in their working environment or even inside their home. |
| Access to Heritage/Religious sites | The major religious sites within the city such as Kashi Vishwanath Temple, Kal Bhairav Temple, etc. were stated to be inaccessible for persons with disabilities. The temple authorities often deny access to persons with disabilities with a wheelchair, crutches or prosthetics. The existence of social stigma or attitudinal barriers make it more difficult to recognise their existence or consider the requirement of special needs or assistance. However, some heritage sites such as Sankat Mochan Temple and Sarnath Complex have integrated barrier free infrastructure e.g. provision for wheel chairs, ramps and support for special assistance within their premises to meet the accessibility standards. These efforts can be used to set good examples for the city to adopt and replicate them within the rest of the city heritage structures. |
| Access to Ghat areas | Most of the participants highlighted the challenges they face while accessing the Ghat areas which are an iconic historical and cultural legacy of the city. Being a resident of the city and not being able to visit these heritage sites has a significant impact on the lives of Persons with disabilities. The oldest part of the city also lacks basic infrastructure such as accessible public toilets, water drinking booths, lack of signages, dedicated pedestrian infrastructure, to name a few. |
Few of the participants also highlighted about the insensitivity of city officials in understanding the specific needs and assistance required for accessing the government services and related digital information (websites, online payments and forms). Persons with disabilities face difficulty in accessing basic services e.g. filling of online forms, generating birth/death certificates, and filing of municipal taxes.

### 6.3 Session III: Participatory Mapping

The session was more oriented towards understanding the city from the perspective of mapping out most and least accessible places in the city. It also aimed to highlight the key efforts of the stakeholders in transforming the city under the vision of - ‘Sugamaya Kashi’. The participants also shared recommendations to improve the access to the city infrastructure and services thus make it accessible, inclusive and safe for all.

Under this session, each group had attempted to map few of the major landmarks in the city and described them as most and least accessible places. The participants also highlighted the route/street network they adopted to reach these specific places. One of the participants described the route from her home (Pandeypur locality) to Banaras Hindu University. Three wheeler or auto rickshaw is the most commonly used and preferred mode of transport. However, the route followed is not pedestrian friendly and lacks basic utilities e.g. accessible public toilets, drinking water facilities, accessible bus stops or resting places, etc.

The campus of Banaras Hindu University is made accessible with provision for barrier free infrastructure and services. The participants also indicated that office of Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities is accessible for them. The officials are also aware of the specific need and support/assistance required by persons with disabilities to access the online/offline services.

The city railway station is not accessible for wheel chair users as there is no provision for ramps to connect the platforms, lifts are placed in limited locations and lack of provision for manual support/assistance required by the persons with disabilities. The ghat areas are inaccessible due to lack of ramps/lifts. The lack of accessible public utilities (e.g. information centres, toilets, drinking water facilities) make it more difficult to access the historic ghats and attend the Ganga Aarti ceremony or access the boating facilities.

The participants also highlighted the difficulty in visiting the historic old temples and heritage sites. The premise of Kashi Vishwanath Temple is not accessible by wheel chair users or similar Assistive Technologies (crutches and prosthetics) because of the existing narrow lanes which connects the main temple to the streets/roads. The premise of Sarnath Temple is accessible from major roads/streets however, the main temple is inaccessible for wheel chair users.
Outcome of the mapping exercise – City map with least and most accessible places
The overall insights and findings from the session can be elaborated as follows:

- Big Bazar (shopping mall) at Sigra has accessible with ramps, tactile paving, availability of assistance for special needs.
- Premises of the Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities are accessible for all. The officials are also aware of the diverse needs associated with different types of disabilities and are implementing projects to make the public buildings and ghat areas accessible to all.
- Banaras Hindu University is considered as accessible for most of the participants.
- Most of the old city area is mostly inaccessible due to the organic pattern of development, haphazard traffic movement, inefficient public transport, lack of access to basic utilities e.g. toilets, drinking facilities, etc.
- Most of the heritage sites and religious places are inaccessible.
- Ghat areas are inaccessible. Participants expressed their inability to visit the Ghats and watch Ganga Aarti or use the boating facilities due to lack accessible infrastructure.
General recommendations and Priority Areas for Intervention

The participants shared a diverse range of recommendations for adoption and implementation by the city stakeholders.

Few of the suggestions can be highlighted as follows:

• Availability of special support/assistance for Persons with disabilities to access the major heritage sites.
• Making the ghat area accessible through installing lifts/ramps or creating an interconnected platform. It may include creating special provisions for Persons with Disabilities to attend the Ganga Aarti, etc.
• Running an awareness and sensitization drive through social media platforms or news channel would play a crucial role in understanding the diverse needs and challenges associated with disability.
• Steps to reduce the social stigma and related barriers associated with disability amongst the citizens and the stakeholders.
• Provision for disapplying digital and audio messages across city intersections, public places and conducting awareness drives about disability amongst city service providers.
• Creating provision for accessible para-transit mode in pedestrianised and crowded streets/road networks.
• Access for Wheel chair users and provision for personal assistance to be provided in popular temples like Kashi Vishwanath, and Kal Bhairav Temple.
• Provision of accessible boarding platform to access the boating area, an interconnected platform for all ghats, and ramps or chair lifts along the ghat staircases.
• Provision for separate lifts for elderly and persons with disabilities in govt buildings, and hospitals.
• Telecast of recordings from similar workshops, stakeholders consultations, or special interviews with persons with disability across popular news channels or social media platforms can be made to build sensitivity among the stakeholders.
Mapping of major landmarks in the city
• Creating provision for “Divyang Complaint Centre” and appointment of “Divyang Mitra” across various parts of the city would play an important role for establishing efficient grievance redressal mechanism for the Persons with disabilities.

Under the Accessible India Campaign, the city stakeholders have made tremendous efforts to solve the issues of inaccessible urban environment. Few of the government and public buildings have integrated barrier-free infrastructure e.g. ramps, lifts, tactile paving, accessible digital information, etc. The Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities in Varanasi is actively involved in creating awareness about the diverse needs associated with different types of disabilities and are implementing projects to make the public buildings and ghat areas accessible to all. Varanasi Smart City Ltd and Varanasi Nagar Nigam are implementing various inclusive interventions, which would comply with the necessary accessibility standards thus creating an accessible, inclusive and safe urban environment for all.
Learnings and Conclusions

The participatory and interactive workshop had assisted us in understanding the grass root level issues related to inaccessibility in Varanasi City. The innovative and replicable solutions as an insights from the workshop would be an eye opener for the stakeholders to understand the challenges and barriers faced by Persons with Disabilities’ (irrespective of age, ability and gender) in the city. The collaborative efforts of the city stakeholders would play an important role in transforming the city as accessible, safe and inclusive for all.

As a next step under the ongoing research studies, a multi-stakeholder workshop with relevant city stakeholders of Varanasi City will be conducted in the 3rd Week of April, 2021. A more informal discussion with stakeholders will be conducted two weeks prior to synthesise the research findings to date. The workshop would aim to share the broad research findings of the primary data collection including interviews and photo dairies, consultative process, participatory activities and infrastructure audit that will be conducted within two pilot areas of the city. The suggestions and recommendation would assist in creating a roadmap for taking future actions towards creating an accessible, inclusive and safe Varanasi City. The overall findings of the study will be published later in 2021.
Annexure

GDI Hub
Global Disability Innovation Hub (GDI Hub) is a research and practice centre driving disability innovation for a fairer world. Operational in 35 countries, delivering 35 projects across a portfolio of £50m, GDI Hub has reached 4 million people since its launch in 2016. Solutions-focused experts in Assistive Technology, Inclusive Design, and Culture and Participation, GDI Hub supports and delivers world-class Research, Teaching, Innovation, Programmes and Advocacy.

AT2030 Programme
AT2030 tests ‘what works’ to improve access to life-changing Assistive Technology (AT) for all; investing £20m over 5 years to support solutions to scale. Led by Global Disability Innovation Hub and funded by UK aid, AT2030 will reach 9 million directly and 6 million more indirectly, driving a lifetime of potential. AT2030 is operational in 31 countries globally.

NIUA
Established in 1976, the National Institute of Urban Affairs (NIUA, is a premier Institute of Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs, Government of India for research and capacity building for the urban sector in India. The Institution has been actively working on bringing forth key areas of concern for urban India to build the urban discourse at various urban scales and committed towards aligning its efforts towards achieving Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) through all its initiatives and programs. It has utilized its competencies in research, knowledge management, policy advocacy and capacity building to address urban challenges and continuously striving to develop sustainable, inclusive, and productive urban ecosystems in the country. It has emerged as a thought leader and knowledge hub for urban development in India and is sought out by both Indian and International organizations for collaborations and partnerships in India’s urban transforming journey.

BASIIC Programme
The Building Accessible, Safe & Inclusive Indian Cities (BASIIIC)* is being implemented by NIUA in collaboration with Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (Mohua) and

Creating an Inclusive and Accessible Varanasi City
support from the Foreign Commonwealth and Development Office (FCDO) of the UK Government. The programme is supporting two partner cities (Varanasi and Pune) through a Technical Assistance Support Unit (TASU) established at NIUA. It endeavours to promulgate the tenets of accessibility, safety and inclusivity in the ethos of urban planning and design. This will be achieved through focused policy-level interventions, pilot demonstration of innovative solutions, capacity building and sustaining the above through application of robust monitoring and evaluation mechanism.

**Kiran Society**
Kiran Society is a non-profit, non-political organization working in an inclusive way for the holistic development of children and persons with and without disabilities, and from marginalized sections of the society.

**Varanasi Smart City Ltd**
Varanasi Smart City Limited (VSCL) has been formed as per the directives of Mohua, Govt. of India as a Special Purpose Vehicle (SPV) under Smart City Mission of Government of India for implementation of Smart City Projects in Varanasi. The mission aims to promote cities that provide core infrastructure and give their citizens a decent quality of life, a clean and sustainable environment through application of ‘Smart’ Solutions. This Special Purpose Vehicle carries end to end responsibility for vendor selection, implementation, and operationalization of various smart city projects within the Varanasi city.
Established in 1976, National Institute of Urban Affairs (NIUA) was tasked to bridge the gap between research and practice on issues related to urbanization, and suggest ways and mechanisms to address these urban challenges of the country. For more than 40 years now, NIUA has been the vanguard for contributing to, and at times, building the urban narrative for a fast-evolving urban India. The Institution has been actively working towards bringing forth key areas of concern for urban India in order to build the urban discourse at various scales.

It has utilized its competencies in research, knowledge management, policy advocacy and capacity building to address the urban challenges, and continuously strive to develop sustainable, inclusive, and productive urban ecosystems in India. It has emerged as a thought leader and knowledge hub for urban development in India, and is sought out by both Indian and International organizations for collaborations and partnerships for India’s urban transforming journey. NIUA is committed towards aligning its efforts towards achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) through all its initiatives and programs.

The Foreign, Commonwealth & Development Office pursues the national interests of the UK and projects the UK as a force for good in the world. FCDO promotes the interests of British citizens, safeguards the UK’s security, defends the UK’s values, works to reduce poverty and tackle global challenges with international partners.